

# Defence Rights

## International and European Developments

Gert Vermeulen (ed.)

Jean Flamme  
Kenneth Gallant  
Caroline Morgan  
Taru Spronken  
Christine Van den Wyngaert  
Gert Vermeulen  
Mikhail Wladimiroff

# Defence Rights

## International and European Developments

Gert Vermeulen (ed.)

Jean Flamme  
Kenneth Gallant  
Caroline Morgan  
Taru Spronken  
Christine Van den Wyngaert  
Gert Vermeulen  
Mikhail Wladimiroff



Maklu

Antwerpen | Apeldoorn | Portland

Defence Rights. International and European Developments  
G. Vermeulen (ed.)  
Antwerpen | Apeldoorn | Portland  
Maklu  
2012

138 pag. – 24 x 16 cm  
ISBN 978-90-466-0571-4  
D/2012/1997/76  
NUR 824



© 2012 Gert Vermeulen & Maklu-Publishers

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or other-wise without the prior permission of the publisher and the authors.

Maklu-Publishers

Somersstraat 13/15, 2018 Antwerpen, Belgium, [info@maklu.be](mailto:info@maklu.be)  
Koninginnelaan 96, 7315 EB Apeldoorn, The Netherlands, [info@maklu.nl](mailto:info@maklu.nl)  
[www.maklu.eu](http://www.maklu.eu)

USA & Canada

International Specialized Book Services

920 NE 58th Ave., Suite 300, Portland, OR 97213-3786, [orders@isbs.com](mailto:orders@isbs.com), [www.isbs.com](http://www.isbs.com)

# Table of Contents

<b>Preface and Acknowledgements</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>The Rome Statute after a decade of enforcement. A critical evaluation</b>	<b>11</b>
MIKHAIL WLADIMIROFF	
I. Introduction	11
II. The court in context	11
III. Defence counsel in context	13
IV. General observations	14
V. A supranational court	16
VI. Getting used to the system	17
VII. Disclosure	18
VIII. Witness protection	19
IX. Specific challenges	19
X. The right to prosecute	21
<b>Independent bars in international criminal courts and tribunals</b>	<b>23</b>
KENNETH S. GALLANT	
I. Introduction	23
II. The ICC needs a bar	23
A. What do we mean by a bar?	24
B. Bars are creations of their own legal systems, organizing lawyers as appropriate to that system	26
C. Missing elements in the international criminal court, and how a bar might fill them	26
D. Reasons for having a bar specific to international tribunals	28
III. How a bar might be created for the ICC	30
<b>The fundamental right to a full and fair defence before the ICC. On the confines of common law and Roman-German Law: an analysis</b>	<b>33</b>
JEAN FLAMME	
I. Introduction	33
II. A 'sui-generis' system, accusatorial but with inquisitorial elements: a good choice ?	34
III. The need and obligation for defence to investigate the case	38
IV. The right to counsel and the legal aid, powers of the Registrar	43
V. The list of counsel and the powers of the registrar	44
VI. 'In-house' counsel, a dangerous experiment	46

VII. Language lost in translation, a cultural nightmare	48
VIII. The principle of free choice of counsel, an inconvenient truth	49
IX. Absence of jurisdiction on corporate bodies	50
X. Conclusion	50

## **Victims before international criminal courts.**

<b>Some views and concerns of an ICC trial judge</b>	<b>53</b>
--	-----------

CHRISTINE VAN DEN WYNGAERT

I. Introduction	53
II. Victims at the ICC	56
A. Victim Status in General	56
B. Victims' Participation in Proceedings	58
C. What Participatory Rights do Victims Have?	60
D. Reparations	62
III. Some views and concerns	63
A. Victims and the Truth Finding Process	63
B. Victims and the Rights of the Accused	64
C. Is the Participatory Regime Meaningful for Victims?	64
D. How Meaningful Can Reparations Be?	65
E. Equal Access to Justice?	67
F. Is the System Sustainable?	68
IV. Final observations	69

## **The EU Procedural Rights Roadmap.**

<b>Background, importance, overview and state of affairs</b>	<b>73</b>
--	-----------

CAROLINE MORGAN

I. Introduction	73
II. Background	73
III. Importance	76
IV. Overview of the Procedural Rights Roadmap: State of affairs	77
V. Conclusion	80

## **Effective Defence.**

<b>The Letter of Rights and the Salduz-directive</b>	<b>81</b>
--	-----------

TARU SPRONKEN

I. Introduction	81
II. Rights of suspects and defendants within Europe: the European Convention on Human Rights	82
III. Challenges the Strasbourg system faces	82
IV. What to do about the gap in European human rights protection?	84
V. EU policy on procedural rights of suspects and defendants: background and recent developments	85

VI. The Lisbon Treaty	87
VII. The Roadmap on procedural rights	89
VIII. Measure B: Information on Rights and Information about the Charges	90
IX. Research Project: An EU-Wide Letter of Rights	92
X. Directive on the right to information in criminal proceedings	96
XI. Research Project: Effective Criminal Defence in Europe	96
XII. The research questions	97
XIII. Five major themes	98
XIV. Measure C Right to Legal Advice and Legal Aid	99
XV. Cross-border cooperation and effective criminal defence	101
XVI. Conclusion	102
 <b>Prisoners' rights in the EU &amp; procedural rights in the context of EU cross-border gathering &amp; use of evidence in criminal matters</b>	 <b>105</b>
<b>GERT VERMEULEN</b>	
I. Context	105
II. EU prisoners' rights	108
A. Introduction	108
B. Problem analysis	110
C. Flanking measures needed	119
D. Conclusion	128
III. Procedural rights in the context of EU cross-border gathering & use of evidence	129
A. Evidence gathering	129
B. Free movement of evidence	135